

In: KSC-BC-2020-05/R001

The Specialist Prosecutor v. Salih Mustafa

Single Judge Panel **Before:**

Judge Gilbert Bitti

Registrar: Fidelma Donlon

Date: 18 September 2024

Language: English

Classification: Public

Public Redacted Version of

Decision on the Registrar's Request for Order to Mr Mustafa to Cooperate

To be notified to:

Victims' Counsel Registry

Anni Pues Fidelma Donlon

Specialist Prosecutor's Office Counsel for Salih Mustafa

Julius von Bóné Kimberly P. West

KSC-BC-2020-05/R001/F00018/RED/2 of 7

Date original: 18/09/2024 17:38:00 PUBLIC

Date public redacted version: 15/04/2025 16:26:00

THE SINGLE JUDGE¹ hereby renders this decision on the Registrar's Request for Order to Mr Mustafa to Cooperate.

I. PROCEDURAL BACKGROUND AND SUBMISSIONS

- 1. On 6 April 2023, Trial Panel I issued a reparation order against Salih Mustafa (Reparation Order and Mr Mustafa, respectively), ordering Mr Mustafa to pay reparations to eight (8) victims (Victims) of crimes he was convicted of, as compensation for the harm inflicted.² The Reparation Order was not appealed either by Mr Mustafa or by Victims' Counsel.
- 2. On 14 December 2023, a Panel of the Court of Appeals Chamber confirmed all of the convictions which formed the basis of the Reparation Order.³
- 3. On 25 March 2024, the Single Judge issued the "Decision on Victims' Counsel's Request to Set a Date for the Payment of Reparations and other Matters" (Decision on Payment of Reparations), in which he, inter alia, instructed the Registrar to conduct an indigence assessment of Mr Mustafa, taking the Legal Aid Regulations⁴ and related Protocol on Indigence Assessment⁵ as a starting point.⁶

¹ KSC-BC-2020-05/R001, F00002, President, Decision Assigning a Single Judge, 17 January 2024, public.

² KSC-BC-2020-05, F00517, Trial Panel I, Reparation Order against Salih Mustafa, 6 April 2023, confidential, paras 250-252, 283, with Annexes 1-4, strictly confidential and ex parte. A corrected public redacted version was issued on 14 April 2023, F00517/RED/COR.

³ KSC-CA-2023-02, F00038/RED, Court of Appeals Panel, <u>Public Redacted Version of Appeal Judgment</u>, 14 December 2023, para. 481.

⁴ KSC-BD-25-Rev1, Registry, Registry Practice Direction: Legal Aid Regulations, 22 February 2024, public.

⁵ KSC-BD-25-Rev1, Registry, Annex A to Legal Aid Regulations: Protocol on Indigence Assessment, 22 February 2024, public.

⁶ KSC-BC-2020-05/R001, F00012, Single Judge, Decision on Victims' Counsel's Request to Set a Date for the Payment of Reparations and other Matters, 25 March 2024, confidential and ex parte, para. 58, with Annexes 1-3, strictly confidential and ex parte. A public redacted version was issued on 22 July 2024, F00012/RED.

Date original: 18/09/2024 17:38:00 PUBLIC Date public redacted version: 15/04/2025 16:26:00

4. On 10 May 2024, the Registrar filed the "Request for Order to Mr Mustafa to Cooperate for the Purposes of the Indigence Assessment" (Registrar's Request).⁷ In it, the Registrar informs the Single Judge that, in accordance with the Protocol on Indigence Assessment, the indigence assessment is based on information provided by the convicted person in a Declaration of Means Form. The Registrar reports that she had unsuccessfully sought Mr Mustafa's cooperation in completing the Declaration of Means Form and therefore requests the Single Judge to order Mr Mustafa to do so. She argues that without the completed Declaration of Means Form, she cannot complete the indigence assessment, "the assessment of Mr Mustafa's indigence is a considerably more complex process" and that she cannot meet the deadline previously set out by the Single Judge.8

- 5. On 29 May 2024, the Registrar submitted the "Report on Execution of the Decision and Orders related to Reparations" (Registrar's First Report), informing the Single Judge that the funds received [REDACTED] would be [REDACTED].9
- 6. On 19 July 2024, the Registrar filed the "Additional Registrar's Report on Execution of the Decision and Orders related to Reparations (F00012)" (Registrar's Second Report), [REDACTED].¹⁰

KSC-BC-2020-05/R001, F00014, Registrar, Registrar's Request for Order to Mr Mustafa to Cooperate for the Purposes of the Indigence Assessment, 10 May 2024, confidential and ex parte, with Annexes 1-2, confidential and ex parte.

⁸ Registrar's Request, paras 10-12.

⁹ KSC-BC-2020-05/R001, F00016, Registrar, Registrar's Report on Execution of the Decision and Orders related to Reparations (F00012), 29 May 2024, confidential and ex parte, paras 22-24, with Annexes 1-4, strictly confidential and ex parte, Annexes 5 and 7, confidential and ex parte, and Annex 6, confidential. Confidential redacted versions of the main filing were filed on 3 June 2024, F00016/CONF/RED and F00016/CONF/RED2, respectively.

¹⁰ KSC-BC-2020-05/R001, F00017, Registrar, Additional Registrar's Report on Execution of the Decision and Orders related to Reparations (F00012), 19 July 2024, confidential and ex parte, para. 4, with Annex 1, strictly confidential and ex parte.

PUBLIC
Date original: 18/09/2024 17:38:00
Date public redacted version: 15/04/2025 16:26:00

II. APPLICABLE LAW

7. The Single Judge notes Articles 22(8), 34(1), 44(6), 53(1) and 55 of Law No. 05/L-

053 on Specialist Chambers and Specialist Prosecutor's Office (Law) and Rules 23(1)

and (8), 65(1) and 82(5) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence before the Kosovo

Specialist Chambers (Rules).

III. **ANALYSIS**

8. The Single Judge observes that Mr Mustafa has not filled out the Declaration of

Means Form.¹¹ The Single Judge finds that, in the above circumstances, the Registrar's

Request is justified as the information contained in the Declaration of Means Form is

needed for the effective implementation of the Reparation Order. Therefore, the Single

Judge orders Mr Mustafa to fill out the Declaration of Means Form without delay, at

the latest by Monday, 7 October 2024. The Single Judge warns Mr Mustafa, pursuant

to Rule 65(1) of the Rules, that he may be sanctioned in case he refuses to comply with

the present order. For any practical matters regarding the Declaration of Means Form,

Mr Mustafa shall liaise with the Registrar, either personally, if he so wishes, or

through his Counsel.

9. Secondly, the Single Judge finds that, for the purpose of assessing indigence in

the context of reparation obligations, the Registrar can take into consideration but is

not bound by the information and documentation provided by the convicted person.

While the Single Judge expects Mr Mustafa to fill out the Declaration of Means Form,

the Registrar must independently gather relevant information and documentation for

the purposes of undertaking Mr Mustafa's indigence assessment, requesting

eventually [REDACTED]. The Single Judge is attentive to the Registrar's submissions

that this would be a more complex process in the absence of any documentation

3

¹¹ Registrar's Request, para. 10.

KSC-BC-2020-05/R001

18 September 2024

Date original: 18/09/2024 17:38:00 PUBLIC Date public redacted version: 15/04/2025 16:26:00

provided by Mr Mustafa. At the same time, the Single Judge recalls that the Legal Aid

Regulations, including their Annex A, are intended primarily to regulate legal aid for

suspects and accused persons requiring the person's input. In the context of

reparations, the Single Judge finds that it is more appropriate to conceive of the

indigence assessment process as one requiring both the convicted person's input and

the Registrar's independent inquiry into the convicted person's means. In conducting

such an inquiry, the Registrar may request [REDACTED].¹² This is because the focus

and imperative of the indigence assessment is to objectively identify whether any

assets or means are indeed available so that the Reparation Order can be executed in

full.

10. In light of the above, and without prejudice to the order to Mr Mustafa to fill in

and provide all information in the Declaration of Means Form, the Single Judge finds

it appropriate to order the Registrar to proceed with initiating an independent inquiry

into Mr Mustafa's assets right away. [REDACTED]. Moreover, the Single Judge varies

the deadline for the Registrar to submit a report on Mr Mustafa's indigence

assessment to Friday, 20 December 2024.

IV. **CLASSIFICATION OF FILINGS**

11. The Single Judge notes that the Registrar has no objection to the reclassification

filing F00017 so that it is made available to Victims' Counsel.¹³ The Single Judge

concurs with the Registrar that F00017 (main filing only) should be notified to Victims'

Counsel. The Single Judge further instructs the Registrar to submit a confidential

redacted version of the Annex, to be notified to Victims' Counsel, applying

4

appropriate redactions pertaining to [REDACTED].

¹² Decision on Payment of Reparations, paras 60 and 66(n).

¹³ See Registrar's Second Report, para. 5.

KSC-BC-2020-05/R001

18 September 2024

Date original: 18/09/2024 17:38:00 PUBLIC Date public redacted version: 15/04/2025 16:26:00

With regard to filing F00014, the Single Judge notes that it has only been notified

to Mr Mustafa. The Single Judge is, however, of the view that there is no reason for

the main filing (excluding its two Annexes) not to be notified to the SPO and Victims'

Counsel, with appropriate redactions in paragraphs 8 and 10 of this filing.

V. **DISPOSITION**

13. For the above-mentioned reasons, the Single Judge hereby:

a. **GRANTS** the Registrar's Request and **ORDERS** Mr Mustafa to fill out

the Declaration of Means Form without delay, at the latest by **Monday**,

7 October 2024;

b. **WARNS** Mr Mustafa, pursuant to Rule 65(1) of the Rules, that he may

be sanctioned in case he refuses to comply with the present order;

c. **ORDERS** the Registrar to initiate right away an independent inquiry

into Mr Mustafa's assets, in accordance with the terms of paragraphs 9

and 10 above;

d. **ORDERS** the Registrar, pursuant to Rule 82(5) of the Rules, to notify

filing F00017 to Victims' Counsel (main filing only), and submit a

confidential redacted version of its Annex, to be notified to Victims'

Counsel, applying appropriate redactions pertaining to [REDACTED];

ORDERS the Registrar to submit a confidential redacted version of e.

filing F00014 (main filing only), in accordance with the terms of

paragraph 12 above, and to notify it to the SPO and Victims' Counsel;

and

Date original: 18/09/2024 17:38:00 Date public redacted version: 15/04/2025 16:26:00

f. **VARIES** the deadline for the Registrar to submit her report on Mr Mustafa's indigence assessment to **Friday**, **20 December 2024**.

Judge Gilbert Bitti Single Judge

Dated this Wednesday, 18 September 2024 At The Hague, the Netherlands.